

Candida FELICI (Istituto Superiore di Studi Musicali, Pavia)

“New” toccatas by Giovanni Gabrieli in the Turin organ tablatures: issues of attribution

Although Giovanni Gabrieli served as organist at the Basilica of San Marco and the Scuola Grande of San Rocco in Venice for many years (1585–1612), only a small number of keyboard compositions by him have come down to us. There are several reasons for this: first, with few exceptions, composers in the period that straddles the late Renaissance and the early Baroque rarely published keyboard music; most of the printed repertoire consisted of sacred or secular vocal music and ensemble instrumental music. Toccatas, ricercars, canzonas¹ or dances, when intended for performance on a keyboard instrument, were usually not printed, but transmitted in manuscripts; we also have to consider the role of improvisation in this particular kind of repertoire. In any case it seems difficult to deny that in the period between the late sixteenth and the early seventeenth centuries, keyboard music played a minor role among musical genres and repertoires, with some significant exceptions such as that of Claudio Merulo, renowned in Italy and abroad as a composer and virtuoso at the keyboard, who published editions of toccatas, expensively produced in

¹ The canzona and especially the ricercar knew a wide dissemination in printed part-books to be played by ensembles of string and/or wind instruments, or to be intabulated for keyboard.

copperplate engraving.² Although Giovanni Gabrieli played a significant role in editing and publishing his uncle Andrea's keyboard music (together with some of his own compositions)³ after the latter's death, as far as publishing his own music was concerned, like his contemporaries he gave precedence to vocal and instrumental ensemble music.⁴

According to the thematic catalogue of Giovanni Gabrieli's works by Richard Charteris⁵ and later additions to it,⁶ the total number of Giovanni's keyboard works amounts to 13 ricercars, 2 fugas, 1 fantasia, 6 canzonas, 4 toccatas and 11 intonations.

In this article I will focus on Gabrieli's toccatas, the pieces that have perhaps suffered most from problems of transmission; indeed in Charteris's thematic catalogue and in the catalogue included in the more recent volume by

² Claudio MERULO, *Toccate d'intavolatura d'organo [...] libro primo* (Roma: Simone Verovio, 1598; RISM A/I: M 2376); *Toccate d'intavolatura d'organo [...] libro secondo* (Roma: Simone Verovio, 1604; RISM A/I: M 2377).

³ Andrea GABRIELI and Giovanni GABRIELI, *Intonazioni d'organo, composte sopra tutti li dodeci toni della musica di Andrea Gabrieli, et di Gio: suo nepote* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1593; RISM A/I: G 80 and 1593¹⁰); A. and G. GABRIELI, *Ricercari [...] Libro secondo* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1595; RISM A/I: G 81 and 1595¹³); A. GABRIELI, *Il terzo libro di ricercari* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1596; RISM A/I: G 82 and 1596¹⁹); A. GABRIELI, *Canzoni alla francese et ricercari ariosi [...] libro quinto* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1605; RISM A/I: G 83 and 1605¹⁸); A. GABRIELI, *Canzoni alla francese per sonar sopra istromenti da tasti [...] libro sesto et ultimo* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1605; RISM A/I: G 84 and 1605¹⁹). The fourth book of Andrea's keyboard works is lost; it contained the versets for three masses; fortunately the content has been transmitted by the Turin organ tablatures (see note 9). Other vocal and instrumental music by Andrea Gabrieli edited by his nephew Giovanni include: A. GABRIELI and G. GABRIELI, *Concerti di Andrea et di Gio: Gabrieli* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1587; RISM A/I: G 58 and 1587¹⁶); A. GABRIELI, *Chori in musica sopra li chori della tragedia di Edippo Tiranno, recitati in Vicenza l'anno M. D. LXXXV* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1588; RISM A/I: G 75); A. GABRIELI and G. GABRIELI, *Di Andrea Gabrielli il terzo libro di madrigali a cinque voci, con alcuni di Giovanni Gabrielli* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1589; RISM A/I: G 76 and 1589¹⁴); A. GABRIELI, *Madrigali et ricercari a quattro voci* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1589; RISM A/I: G 77).

⁴ G. GABRIELI, *Sacrae Symphoniae* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1597; RISM A/I: G 86); posthumous editions are: G. GABRIELI, *Symphoniae Sacrae* (Venezia: Bartolomeo Magni, 1615; RISM A/I: G 87); G. GABRIELI, *Canzoni et sonate* (Venezia: Bartolomeo Magni, 1615; RISM A/I: G 88).

⁵ Richard CHARTERIS, *Giovanni Gabrieli (Ca. 1555–1612): A Thematic Catalogue of His Music* (Styvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1996).

⁶ R. CHARTERIS, "A New Keyboard Work by Giovanni Gabrieli and the Relevance of its Compositional Technique", *Music & Letters* 85/1 (2004): 1–21.

Rodolfo Baroncini devoted to Giovanni Gabrieli only four compositions in this genre are assigned to him.⁷

During Gabrieli's lifetime one of his toccatas was included in the anthology which Girolamo Diruta published in his *Il Transilvano*⁸ and eleven brief intonations were published in the *Intonazioni d'organo di Andrea Gabrieli et di Gio: suo nepote* in 1593. Because of their brevity, the latter give little idea of Gabrieli's ability at the keyboard, while the toccata in the *Transilvano* gives us a much clearer image of his compositional style: scalar figurations ascending or descending the keyboard for two octaves or more; motifs echoed at the octave or fifth, irregular lines, sequential patterns, leaps and broken chords. These features mean that Giovanni's toccatas are more innovative than those of Andrea Gabrieli, whose style was more fluid, with slower harmonic rhythm, prevalence of conjunct passagework and less frequent passing of figures from one hand to the other. The toccata of Giovanni on the other hand shows significant traces of Merulo's influence, even if it lacks those imitative sections so important in the music of the latter.

Almost all of Giovanni's keyboard oeuvre is preserved in the Turin organ tablatures,⁹ a source made up of 16 volumes now held at the Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria of Turin (with shelf marks *Giordano* 1–8 and *Foà* 1–8), compiled from around 1637 to 1640, possibly in Southern Germany. It transcribes everything into the type of alphabetic notation known as new German organ tablature and as a source is of fundamental importance to our knowledge of European keyboard music dating from the mid-sixteenth century to the 1630s. *Turin* contains many of Gabrieli's compositions for which no concordances exist, as we can see from Table 1.

⁷ Rodolfo BARONCINI, *Giovanni Gabrieli* (Palermo: L'Epos, 2013). Baroncini, however, proposes to add to Gabrieli's catalogue a fifth toccata, D 14 (see later in this article).

⁸ Girolamo DIRUTA, *Il Transilvano dialogo sopra il vero modo di sonar organi et istromenti da penna* (Venezia: Giacomo Vincenti, 1593; RISM A/I: 1593⁹, reprints 1597²⁵, 1612¹⁷ and 1625¹¹), fol. 22.

⁹ Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria, Fondo Foà Giordano, *Giordano* 1–8, *Foà* 1–8 (hereafter cited as *Turin*). For an inventory of the source, along with commentary, see Oscar MISCHIATI, "L'intavolatura d'organo tedesca della Biblioteca Nazionale di Torino", *L'Organo* 4 (1963): 2–154 and 237–238. For a study of the manuscript with particular emphasis on Italian and anonymous toccatas and ricercars see Candida FELICI, *Musica italiana nella Germania del Seicento. I ricercari dell'intavolatura d'organo tedesca di Torino* (Firenze: Olschki, 2005) (*Historiae Musicae Cultores* 107). See also Robert JUDD, *The Use of Notational Formats at the Keyboard* (Ph.D. diss., Oxford University, 1989).

Table 1. Compositions of Giovanni Gabrieli in *Turin*

Compositions of Giovanni Gabrieli	Concordances with prints	Variants in the attribution	Works without concordances
11 toccatas	1 from Diruta's <i>Transilvano</i>		10 (1 in two versions in <i>Turin</i>)
11 intabulated motets	4 from <i>Sacrae Symphoniae</i> (1597); 2 from <i>Reliquiae sacrorum concentuum</i> (1615);* 4 from <i>Symphoniae Sacrae</i> (1615)		1
10 ricercars and fugas	2 from <i>Intonationi</i> (1593)		6
8 canzonas	2 from Raveri's anthology (1608)**	1 attributed to Claudio Merulo in <i>Turin</i> ; 2 attributed to Christian Erbach in other sources	1

* *Reliquiae sacrorum concentuum Giovan Gabrielis, Johan-Leonis Hasleri, utriusque praestantissimi Musici* (Nürnberg: Paul Kauffmann, 1615; RISM A/I: 1615²).

** *Canzoni per sonare con ogni sorte di stromenti, a quattro, cinque, & otto, con il suo basso generale per l'organo* (Venezia: Alessandro Raveri, 1608; RISM A/I: 1608²⁴)

Turin is a particularly important source for the South-German and Italian repertoire, especially for Venetian music; only in rare cases has the attribution given by the copyist proved to be incorrect. Richard Charteris considers the attribution of Gabrieli's ricercars and canzonas, with one exception,¹⁰ to be valid, but in the case of the toccatas he regards seven of the ten works unique to this source as doubtful.

Before focusing on how Gabrieli's compositions were transcribed in the manuscript, one has to add that, while the attributions given by the copyist are quite reliable, those in the indices at the beginning of each volume have

¹⁰ The canzona in *Foà 3* No. 34 is attributed to Claudio Merulo in this source, but Charteris follows the attribution to Giovanni Gabrieli given in Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Rés. Vmd. ms. 27, fols. 26v–29v, *Canzon di Giovanni Gabriell.*; see CHARTERIS, "Another keyboard canzona by Giovanni Gabrieli?", *Early Music* 15/4 (1987): 480–486.

no documentary significance, since they were added in the eighteenth century when the volumes, which formed part of the vast collection belonging to the Venetian nobleman Jacopo Soranzo, were rebound in Venice.¹¹ It appears that the compiler of these indices wanted to assign every piece to a particular composer, so, since many works lacked attributions in the source, he assigned all the compositions following an attributed work to the same composer until he reached the next piece ascribed by the copyist to a different composer. The attributions given by the original scribe on the other hand are reliable for the following reasons: *Turin* contains many works of Venetian origin otherwise unknown or lost (like Andrea Gabrieli’s organ masses);¹² it transmits some pieces in a version different from that found in prints of the period, apparently emanating from a composer’s own manuscript (as in the case of Merulo’s toccatas No. 8 from *Libro primo* and *Libro secondo* or the ricercars from his *Ricercari intabulati*); only rarely has an attribution been contradicted by other evidence.

As far as the toccatas of Gabrieli are concerned the situation is as follows: in *Giordano 2*, No. 21, the scribe copied a *Toccata di Giovan Gabrieli*, then followed it with a work entitled *Toccate di Giovan Gabriel. Toccata Prima* (No. 22); after this we have two toccatas “primi toni” (the first of which had in fact already been transcribed as No. 15) and six works each entitled simply *Toccata*. Three toccatas by Andrea Gabrieli (not attributed) from the *Intonazioni d’organo* of 1593 complete the series (see Table 2).

Table 2. Toccatas attributed to Giovanni Gabrieli in *Turin*

I-Tn, <i>Giordano 2</i>		Concordances	Dalla Libera edition, vol. 2	Thematic catalogue
No. 21	<i>Toccata di Giovan Gabrieli</i>		No. 14	C 237

¹¹ See MISCHIATI, “L’intavolatura d’organo tedesca della Biblioteca Nazionale di Torino”: 14–16, and FELICI, *Musica italiana nella Germania del Seicento* 1–2. On Jacopo Soranzo and the dispersal of his library see Alberto BASSO, Introduction to Isabella Fragalà Data and Annarita Colturato, *Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria di Torino. Raccolta Mauro Foà, raccolta Renzo Giordano* (Roma: Torre D’Orfeo, 1987) (Cataloghi di fondi musicali italiani 7): XLVIII–LII.

¹² See note 3.

No. 22	<i>Toccate di Giovan Gabriel. Toccata Prima</i>		No. 15	C 238
No. 23 = No. 15	<i>Toccata Primi Toni</i>		No. 16	C 239
No. 24	<i>Toccata Primi Toni</i>		No. 17	D 10
No. 25	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 18	D 11
No. 26	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 19	D 12
No. 27	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 20	D 13
No. 28	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 21	D 14
No. 29	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 22	D 15
No. 30	<i>Toccata</i>		No. 23	D 16
No. 31	<i>Toccata del Nono Tono</i>	Andrea Gabrieli (<i>Intonazioni</i> , 1593)		
No. 32	<i>Toccata del sesto Tono</i>	Andrea Gabrieli (<i>Intonazioni</i> , 1593)		
No. 33	<i>Toccata dell'ottavo Tono</i>	Andrea Gabrieli (<i>Intonazioni</i> , 1593)		

In the thematic catalogue Charteris considers only the first three works, Nos. 21–23, to be unquestionably by Gabrieli:

The music copyist of the Turin source has only attributed the first two of these works, and these to Giovanni Gabrieli, leaving the remaining works unattributed. However, the use of the description “Toccate di Giovan Gabriel. Toccata Prima” with the second work informs us that one or more of the subsequent unattributed works belongs to the same composer. [...] An examination of the two attributed works and the first unattributed work reveals that their style is consistent with that of C236 and C240–C250, which are unquestionably by Giovanni Gabrieli. [...] However, serious doubt exists about the validity of the attribution to Giovanni Gabrieli extending to the remaining seven toccatas. Some of the latter works have the occasional device that can be traced in Gabrieli’s genuine works, but since similar passages are also found in works by other composers of the period they offer no conclusive evidence of Gabrieli’s authorship. For the most part, the seven unattributed works are quite untypical of Gabrieli’s style, and some are so amateurish as to defy any connection with Gabrieli.¹³

Charteris accepts Gabrieli’s authorship of the first two works, for they are explicitly attributed to him in the source, and also assigns the (unattributed-

¹³ CHARTERIS, *Giovanni Gabrieli (Ca. 1555–1612): A Thematic Catalogue*: 304.

ed) work which immediately follows them to Giovanni because the title of the second piece in the group, which precedes it (*Toccate di Giovan Gabriel. Toccata Prima*), implies that the following toccata or toccatas are also by Gabrieli. However, he considers the attribution valid only for the first toccata that follows those explicitly by Giovanni.

Let us now consider Gabrieli's ricercars that were copied into *Giordano 6*: the first work is a *Ricercar primo di Gio: Gabrieli*, followed by four pieces entitled simply *Ricercar* and two others entitled *Fuga*. The title *Ricercar primo*, as in the case of the toccatas, implies that other works of the same series follow and indeed that was understood to be the case not only by Sandro Dalla Libera who published these compositions for the first time in 1958,¹⁴ but also by Richard Charteris who includes them as authentic works by Gabrieli.

Compared to the series of toccatas that of the ricercars has the advantage that the second and eighth piece are concordant with pieces attributed to Gabrieli in other sources. Nevertheless, the *Turin* scribe's method used here is presumably the same as in the case of the toccatas; while the author's name is given only for the first piece of the series, the title informs us, in each case, that it is in fact the first of a group of works by the same composer: *Toccate di Giovan Gabrieli. Toccata prima* and *Ricercar primo di Gio: Gabrieli*. We find the same method applied in other instances in *Turin*, as in the case of Merulo's toccatas from the first (1598) and second book (1604), Andrea Gabrieli's ricercars from his second (1595) and third *Libro de ricercari* (1596)¹⁵ and Costanzo Antegnati's ricercars from the *Antegnata, Intavolatura de' ricercari d'organo*;¹⁶ for all these works the *Turin* scribe includes the composer's name only in the first title of the series.

Since the ricercars and the toccatas are treated in the same way by the scribe, we can assume that Charteris regards the toccatas as doubtful because they lack concordances. The other reason given by Charteris concerns the question of style: toccatas Nos. 24–30 would not share the characteristics of

¹⁴ G. GABRIELI, *Composizioni per organo*, ed. Sandro Dalla Libera (Milano: Ricordi, 1957–1959), 3 vols., vol. 2 (1958).

¹⁵ Andrea Gabrieli's ricercars were copied in *Giordano 6*, fols. 77v–123v; Merulo's toccatas from the two volumes of *Toccate d'intavolatura* were transcribed in *Giordano 2*, 62v–107.

¹⁶ COSTANZO ANTEGNATI, *Antegnata, Intavolatura de' ricercari d'organo* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1608); it was transcribed in *Giordano 6*, fols. 20v–41.

the authentic works, namely the toccata in the *Transilvano* and the eleven intonations published together with works by Andrea.

Here we are faced with another kind of difficulty: can we really claim to understand Giovanni's style of composition by means of a single toccata and eleven brief intonations? Vincent Panetta, in his doctoral dissertation on the toccatas of Hans Leo Hassler,¹⁷ examines the works of the same genre by Giovanni Gabrieli transmitted in *Turin*, using only the published compositions as a basis for comparison. Concerning the *Toccata Primi Toni* No. 24, D 10 in the thematic catalogue, he observes that in this piece the harmonic rhythm changes at the rate of the *brevis* and the passagework is confined to one hand for many *breves*, unlike in the other toccatas by Giovanni.¹⁸ While the preceding toccata, No. 23, C 239, has in fact a faster harmonic rhythm, nevertheless in the second toccata of Gabrieli's group, C 238, the harmonic rhythm changes at the rate of the *brevis* from bar 3 to bar 8. Then Panetta describes two mistakes, which would confirm that the toccata No. 24 should not be ascribed to Giovanni Gabrieli: at bar 10¹⁹ the ascending line in the Bass is truncated erroneously, moreover the final chord of the composition is not correct. The passage in bar 10, that for Panetta is «no less than inept»,²⁰ would be easily resolved if the ascending line following the downward leap were to be transposed down an octave in order to arrive in conjunct motion to the *c* of the following bar; therefore, it is probably an octave error of the kind very often encountered in German organ tablatures (see example 1). The other objection, concerning the final chord, is resolved looking at the manuscript, where the chord is correct (*d-f#-a-d"-a"*) and *a'* in Dalla Libera edition proves to be an editorial mistake

¹⁷ Vincent PANETTA, "Hans Leo Hassler and the Keyboard Toccata: Antecedents, Sources, Style" (Ph.D. diss., Harvard University, 1991).

¹⁸ PANETTA, "Hans Leo Hassler and the Keyboard Toccata": 95: «The next work in the Giordano source, also entitled *Toccata Primi Toni* (N° 24) presents a striking contrast to the three toccatas discussed so far. In this work, harmonic rhythm moves primarily at the rate of the *breve*, not at the quicker pace evident in other toccatas of Giovanni. The textures employed also appear to argue against the idea of Giovanni's authorship. For example, throughout measures 7–12 of the work, the moving passagework voice is confined to the left hand, combining with *breve* chords in the upper three voices. Such a passage is entirely uncharacteristic of Giovanni's known toccatas, in which the textural dispositions, far more active and unpredictable, are never maintained for such a long duration».

¹⁹ References to bars in the text and barring in the musical examples follow Dalla Libera edition (the German organ tablature has no barlines).

²⁰ See PANETTA, "Hans Leo Hassler and the Keyboard Toccata": 96.

for *a* (see example 2). In another case Panetta takes for rudimentary writing what is in fact a mistake of the modern edition: in the toccata No. 28 of *Giordano 2*, D 14, the Soprano *a'* clashes with the *b*, in the Tenor; also in this case it is not a mistake of the scribe or of the composer, but simply an error of the modern edition (see example 3).

The image shows two systems of musical notation for Example 1. Each system consists of a treble clef staff and a bass clef staff. The top system shows a sequence of chords in the treble staff and a melodic line in the bass staff. A box highlights a specific measure in the bass staff. An arrow points from this box to the corresponding measure in the bottom system, where the note has been corrected.

Ex. 1. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata primi toni*, *Giordano 2* No. 24, D 10, bars 10–11

The image shows two systems of musical notation for Example 2. The top system is labeled "Dalla Libera edition" and the bottom system is labeled "Turin". Both systems consist of a treble clef staff and a bass clef staff. The top system shows a sequence of chords in the treble staff and a melodic line in the bass staff. An arrow points to a specific measure in the top system, where the note has been corrected.

Ex. 2. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata primi toni*, *Giordano 2* No. 24, D 10, bars 17–18

Dalla Libera edition

Turin

Ex. 3. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata, Giordano 2* No. 28, D 14, bars 1–3

Another feature of these compositions seems to Panetta quite uncharacteristic of Gabrieli's style: the frequent sudden change from a minor chord to a major chord and vice versa. An example of this occurs in the toccata No. 28 at bar 9: here we encounter a shift from a *g* minor chord in the first half of the measure to a *g* major chord at the following semibreve (see example 4); for Panetta this feature shows «that the composer's control over the tonal direction of the composition lacked refinement».²¹ Nevertheless this abrupt change, as already highlighted by Denis Arnold in his volume on Giovanni Gabrieli,²² is typical for this composer; he uses it as an expressive device, often associated with a change in register, as in the toccata C 237, the first piece attributed to Gabrieli in *Giordano 2*, accepted as authentic by Charteris and Panetta, where, at bar 6, we meet a sudden shift from a *g* major chord to a *g* minor chord after only a minim, at the same time substituting *f* natural for *f*[#] in the ensuing figure (see example 5).²³

²¹ See PANETTA, "Hans Leo Hassler and the Keyboard Toccata": 104.

²² DENIS ARNOLD, *Giovanni Gabrieli and the Music of the Venetian High Renaissance* (London: Oxford University Press, 1979): 49.

²³ Baroncini proposes adding the toccata D 14 to the corpus of Gabrieli's works because of the presence of this harmonic device, see BARONCINI, *Giovanni Gabrieli*: 327–328.



Ex. 4. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata*, *Giordano 2* No. 28, D 14, bars 8–9



Ex. 5. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata di Giovan Gabrieli*, *Giordano 2* No. 21, C 237, bar 6

If we consider this feature foreign to the Venetian tradition, we have also to cast doubt on the authenticity of the toccata C 237. As Baroncini has made quite clear in his volume on Giovanni Gabrieli, this sudden harmonic change is particularly evident in late works of Gabrieli, as in *Angelus Domini* (*Sacrae Symphoniae*, 1597), where in bars 27–31 the voices alternate major with minor thirds. The toccata D 14 has striking similarities with the toccata C 237 and with the toccata in the *Transilvano*, which is also in the second mode.

If we examine the other toccatas in *Giordano 2*, we find that the toccata No. 29 begins in a completely different way from the pieces which we have dealt with until now. It has an imitative opening, where a motif with dotted rhythm passes through the voices until it is replaced by conventional passage-work (see example 6).

Ex. 6. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata, Giordano 2* No. 29, D 15, bars 1–8

Panetta argues that this toccata has also to be excluded from Gabrieli's catalogue since nothing similar is found in the other known toccatas of Giovanni. However, if we consider that what has survived is certainly only a tiny sample of what Gabrieli wrote and improvised, it is at the very least hazardous to exclude the toccata No. 29 for this reason alone. It would seem to be more useful to see whether this feature appears in other works, vocal or instrumental, by Gabrieli; in fact we find it in several of Giovanni's later pieces: in the motet *O Jesu mi dulcissime* (*Symphoniae Sacrae*, 1615), bars 19–27, or in *Hodie completi sunt* (*Symphoniae Sacrae*), bars 11–14, where a motif of the same type recurs in imitation in a way similar to the toccata No. 29 (see example 7).²⁴ Moreover, the latter piece shows all the features typical of

²⁴ The examples from Gabrieli's vocal and instrumental works follow Giovanni GABRIELI, *Opera Omnia*, vols. 1–6 (1956–1974), ed. Denis Arnold, vols. 7–12 (1991–) ed. Richard Charteris (Neuhausen-Stuttgart: American Institute of Musicology) (*Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae* 12).

Gabrieli's keyboard writing: sequential motifs, echo figurations and broken chords similar to those in the *Toccatà primi toni* C 239, the *Ricercare* C 218 and the *Canzon* C 233.

The image displays a musical score for a vocal and keyboard piece. It consists of five systems of staves. Each system includes a vocal line (treble clef) and a keyboard accompaniment line (bass clef). The lyrics are in Latin and are written below the vocal line. The score shows a sequence of motifs and echo figurations, with some phrases repeated and marked with [stes].

Lyrics from the score:

- di - - -
- di - - - es pen - te -
- di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - -
- di - es pen - te - co - - - - -
- di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - -
- es pen - te - co - stes, di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- co - stes, di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- stes, di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- stes, di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - - [stes]
- stes, di - - - es pen - te - co - stes - - - pen - te - co [stes]
- stes, - - - - di - - - es pen - te - co - - - - [stes]

Ex. 7. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Hodie completi sunt*, *Symphoniae sacrae*, 1615, bars 11–14

If the toccata No. 29 can be regarded as a particularly significant piece, the same applies to the toccata No. 30 (see example 8). The introduction, as in the previous work, contains imitative writing and, according to Panetta, it is «quite distinct from what might be expected at the beginning of a conventional Venetian toccata. In nearly all of the Venetian works, a chordal opening gives way after a few breve measures to a passagework segment of clearly defined, stratified texture».²⁵ Now, if in Gabrieli's group of pieces in *Turin* only toccatas Nos. 29 and 30 have an imitative beginning, nevertheless many Venetian toccatas share this characteristic, especially those of Merulo but also the second toccata by Andrea Gabrieli in Diruta's *Transilvano*.²⁶ The *exordium* of the toccata No. 30 also introduces brief motifs in imitation not otherwise encountered in any Venetian toccata of the period, but such motifs are often encountered in the canzonas, the sonatas as well as in Gabrieli's vocal compositions: the figure consisting of a dotted *semiminima* followed by two *semifusae*, used sequentially at bars 5–6, appears in the madrigal *Dormiva dolcemente* (*Dialoghi musicali*, 1590),²⁷ bars 39–47, and the figuration at bars 10–11 in imitation descending from the Soprano to the Bass is almost a perfect quotation from the *Sonata contra violini* (*Canzoni et sonate*, 1615), bar 27 (see example 9), and is also found in the motet *Quem vidistis pastores?* (*Symphoniae Sacrae*, 1615), bar 66. Some features of this toccata, in particular those in bars 20–21, also characterize the final section of the ricercar No. 6 in *Giordano 6* (C 222).

The presence of particularly expressive figures that gradually intensify and culminate in scales in contrary motion (bar 44, see example 10) — a feature completely unknown in contemporary Venetian toccatas — allows us to hypothesize that we are faced with a late work by Gabrieli, in the *seconda prattica* climate, forecasting the style and aesthetics of Frescobaldi's toccatas. We find similar passages in the *Canzoni et sonate* of 1615, in particular the two-voice scalar figuration in contrary motion appears in the *Canzon 10* (C 203), bars 65–67.

²⁵ PANETTA, "Hans Leo Hassler": 108.

²⁶ DIRUTA, *Il Transilvano*, fol. 32v.

²⁷ *Dialoghi musicali* (Venezia: Angelo Gardano, 1590; RISM A/I: 1590¹¹).

"New" toccatas by Giovanni Gabrieli

The image shows a musical score for a toccata by Giovanni Gabrieli. It consists of four systems of two staves each (treble and bass clef). The first system (bars 1-3) features a melodic line in the treble clef and a harmonic accompaniment in the bass clef. The second system (bars 4-6) begins with a complex rhythmic pattern in the treble clef, followed by a more melodic line. The third system (bars 7-9) continues the melodic development in the treble clef. The fourth system (bars 10-11) shows a final melodic phrase in the treble clef and a rhythmic accompaniment in the bass clef.

Ex. 8. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata, Giordano 2* No. 30, D 16, bars 1-11

The image shows a musical score for a sonata by Giovanni Gabrieli. It consists of four staves (three treble clefs and one bass clef). The first two staves (treble clefs) have a melodic line with a rhythmic pattern. The third staff (treble clef) has a harmonic accompaniment. The fourth staff (bass clef) has a rhythmic accompaniment.

Ex. 9. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Sonata con tre violini, Canzoni e sonate*, 1615, C 214, bars 27-28



Ex. 10. Giovanni Gabrieli, *Toccata, Giordano 2* No. 30, D 16, bar 44

However, the series of “Gabrieli” toccatas in *Giordano 2* is not a homogeneous group: while Nos. 21, 22, 23, 28, 29 and 30 have quite sophisticated writing and contain features similar to those found in other works by Gabrieli, other toccatas in the same group have a much simpler design. In particular, toccatas Nos. 25 and 27, which have in common the same incipit consisting of a descending scale over a three-octave range—not encountered in toccatas by Merulo or Andrea Gabrieli—, display a slow harmonic rhythm and long scalar lines confined to one hand; nevertheless both also have the same sequential and echo writing so characteristic of Giovanni Gabrieli. Perhaps, given their manuscript transmission, they did not undergo the revision process they would have had, had Giovanni prepared them for publication. Many Venetian manuscripts could have been made accessible to the *Turin* copyist via the pupils of the most important Venetian masters, such as the Gabrielis and Merulo. *Turin* contains two of the latter’s toccatas — No. 8 from his *Primo Libro* and No. 8 from his *Secondo Libro*— in two different versions: one derived from the print and the other with longer note values, a slower harmonic rhythm, simpler figurations; the simpler version evidently precedes the revision made by the composer for publication during the last years of his life.²⁸

In summary, I would like to propose the following considerations in relation to the examined source and the analysis of the toccatas, the authorship of which has been questioned. Even if the attributions given in the indices added to the *Turin* volumes cannot be considered reliable for the aforementioned reasons, the attributions given by the principal scribe must be considered as

²⁸ The two books of toccatas appeared in print very late in Merulo’s career (in 1598 and 1604). For a comparison between the different versions of the toccatas No. 8 see JUDD, *The Use of Notational Formats at the Keyboard*: 238–271.

highly reliable. The absence of Gabrieli's name in the titles of the toccatas following the first two works reflects the copyist's normal approach in the case of groups of works by the same composer. The likelihood of these toccatas being by Gabrieli is increased by the fact that the toccatas following the group are by his uncle Andrea — from the *Intonazioni d'organo* of 1593 — probably emanating from the same manuscript which the copyist used as the source for the transcription of toccatas Nos. 21–30.

Moreover, stylistic comparison can prove useful only when it also takes into consideration the vocal and instrumental works by the same composer, especially in cases like this where only a few pieces of the same genre survive. A comparative analysis of Gabrieli's output reveals quite clearly the stylistic relationship between his vocal and instrumental ensemble works, and the toccatas in *Giordano 2*, with their similar motifs, devices, dialogues between voices and harmonic handling. In particular, some toccatas — Nos. 21, 29 and 30 — show features of Gabrieli's late style and enable us to get a glimpse of the Venetian toccata in the first years of the seventeenth century.

In conclusion, I believe that the attribution in the manuscript, although only implicit, has to be accepted and that the toccatas transmitted in *Turin* should be included in the corpus of Gabrieli's authentic works.

Summary

Almost all of Giovanni Gabrieli's keyboard output has been transmitted in German sources, the most important of which are the German organ tablatures now held at the Turin National Library (I-Tn, *Fondo Foà Giordano*, *Giordano* 1–8, *Foà* 1–8). The lack of concordances and the way of transmission have led some scholars to consider many of these compositions as doubtful or even spurious works, as in the case of a group of toccatas in *Giordano 2*. This article examines the characteristics of the Turin tablatures and the way of transmission of Gabrieli's toccatas, in order to propose a reconsideration of their exclusion. Due to the small number of free-style works whose attribution to Gabrieli is without question, the article proposes an analysis of the toccatas through the comparison with the larger corpus of Gabrieli's works, both vocal and instrumental: indeed, some of the *Turin* toccatas reveal strong similarities with late compositions by Gabrieli. Through both a philological and an analytical approach, the article proposes adding the *Turin* toccatas to the corpus of Gabrieli's authentic works.

Keywords: Giovanni Gabrieli, Turin organ tablatures, Keyboard music

